

“Identifying differences across countries: transnational intelligence and transnational oversight”

Intelligence Oversight					
Civic Oversight			Delegated Oversight		
Media Scrutiny	Civil Society Scrutiny	Rights & Remedies	Parliamentary Scrutiny	Judicial Scrutiny	Expert Scrutiny
Resources	Resources	Access to Information	Resources	Resources	Resources
Media Reporting Protection	Campaigning Policy Advocacy	Judicial Remedy Complaint Mechanism	Mandate Investigatory Powers	Mandate Authorization Powers	Mandate Access
Constraints Attitudes	Strategic Litigation Protection		Access Independence	Investigatory Powers Access	Independence Obligations to the Public
	Constraints Attitudes		Obligations to the Public Cooperation and Advisory Relations Enforcement Perceived Impact Attitudes	Independence Obligations to the Public Cooperation and Advisory Relations Enforcement Perceived Impact Attitudes	Cooperation and Advisory Relations Perceived Impact Attitudes

Transnational Oversight	
Delegated Oversight	
Component	Indicators
Mandate	Oversight of foreign surveillance (outside of national territory) Oversight of transnational intelligence cooperation Definition of ‘third parties’
Investigative Powers	Number of inquiries that cover intelligence cooperation Frequency of inquiries denied with reference to ‘third party rule’
Cooperation and Advisory Relations	Informal and formal cooperation with foreign oversight bodies Legal basis for oversight cooperation
Access	Access to shared databases Access to data transferred to third parties Access to data received from third parties Access to shared selectors
Enforcement	Oppose a transnational intelligence cooperation or operation
Civic Oversight	
Component	Indicators
Public campaigning Policy Advocacy Strategic Litigation	Frequency of transnational issues addressed Frequency of transnational cooperation with foreign CSOs
Media Reporting	Frequency of transnational angle in articles Frequency of transnational cooperation with foreign journalists Transnational investigative research projects
Access to Information	Notification rights for foreigners Subject access rights for foreigners
Judicial Remedy	Access to judicial remedy against surveillance by intelligence agencies in a court of first instance Frequency and impact of legal challenges by non-citizens Basic conditions to initiate legal proceedings for non-citizens
Complaint mechanisms	Access to complaint mechanisms against surveillance by intelligence agencies for non-citizens Frequency and impact of complaints filed by non-citizens Basic conditions for non-citizens to file a complaint